

**THE CITY OF CHESTERFIELD
ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD
June 14, 2012**

PRESENT

Mr. Matt Adams
Ms. Mary Brown
Mr. Rick Clawson
Ms. Carol Duenke
Mr. Randy Logan, Council Member
Ms. Wendy Geckeler, Planning Commission Liaison
Mr. Mike Watson, Planning Commission Member
Ms. Aimee Nassif, Planning and Development Services Director
Ms. Mara Perry, Senior Planner
Mr. Shawn Seymour, Senior Planner
Ms. Kathy Juergens, Recording Secretary
Ms. Purvi Patel, Planning Intern

ABSENT

Mr. Bud Gruchalla
Mr. Gary Perkins

I. CALL TO ORDER

Chair Carol Duenke called the meeting to order at 6:30 p.m. and stated that Aimee Nassif, Planning and Development Services Director, had some announcements before the project presentations. She also informed the Board of a change in the order of project presentations.

Aimee Nassif, Planning and Development Services Director, informed the Board of several staff changes and announced that Senior Planner, Justin Wyse, will be the new staff liaison for the Architectural Review Board.

II. PROJECT PRESENTATIONS

- A. Delmar Gardens on the Green:** Amended Architectural Elevations, Amended Landscape Plan and an Architect's Statement of Design for an 11.686 acre lot of land zoned "R1" Residence District with a "CUP" Conditional use Permit located on the north side of Clayton Road.

Ms. Mara Perry, Senior Planner, presented the project request for changes to an existing entry. A new covered entry is proposed which will not affect circulation in the current drop-off area. Changes will also include a new water feature, additional paving, new bollard lighting, and new landscaping to enhance the entrance. The existing building is primarily brick with EIFS in a band along the top of the building. The brick and EIFS will be retained for the existing part of the building which remains visible. The new entry will be made of two colors of EIFS with a standing seam metal roof. These proposed changes are very similar to

changes they have made at their other facility in Chesterfield. Currently there are no further changes to this location; however, they may continue to upgrade this facility in the future.

Discussion:

Board Member Mary Brown, asked how the new lighter color blends in with the existing building. Ms. Perry stated at this time, the lighter color is only being used at the entrance. The rest of the building is brick.

Board Chair Duenke commented that this provides a very strong sense of entry and is a very attractive upgrade.

Board Chair Clawson stated this was consistent with their other locations and it is an improvement.

Board Member Mary Brown made a motion to forward the Amended Architectural Elevations, Amended Landscape Plan and Architect's Statement of Design for Delmar Gardens on the Green, as presented, with a recommendation for approval to the Planning Commission.

Board Member Matt Adams seconded the motion.

Motion passed with a voice vote of 4-0.

- B. Friendship Village of West County (15201 Olive Boulevard):** 6th Partial Amended Site Development Plan, Amended Landscape Plan, Amended Lighting Plan, Architectural Elevations and an Architect's Statement of Design for a 34.5 acre tract of land zoned "R4" Residence District with a "CUP" Conditional Use Permit at the northwest corner of Olive Boulevard and Arrowhead Estates Lane.

Mara Perry, Senior Planner, presented the project request for a new 30 unit independent living addition with underground parking and three independent living villas. This is phase 1 of a multi-phase master plan to improve the overall quality and effectiveness of its services and facilities. The three villas came before this Board and the Planning Commission in 2007 as part of a larger approval for a multi-purpose building and seven villas. The plan was given unanimous approval by both Boards and the three villas did reach the permit stage, however, they were put on hold. The permits have since expired and they are resubmitting.

The addition is for 30 independent living units which will be adjoining one of the existing three-story Independent Living brick buildings. There will be a series of new pedestrian walkways, surface parking spaces as well as underground

parking. The proposed landscape plan meets the City's current requirements. A small water feature is included in the courtyard setting along with water quality features per MSD requirements.

The villas are proposed on a lot that is facing Olive Boulevard. There is a change in the grade from Olive Boulevard to the development. A retaining wall is proposed that will connect with other retaining walls that separate the upper portion of the site along Olive Boulevard. The sidewalk will be connected along Olive. The three units will be facing another set of three units. Individual HVAC units will be at ground level either at the rear or side of the units and will include some landscaping around them. The new units will match the other villas in the development.

Discussion

Board Member Rick Clawson asked if the proposed masonry materials match the existing materials and it was confirmed that the proposed materials are a very close match. It was also confirmed that rooftop equipment is to be screened with the architecture and there are no new proposed trash enclosures.

Board Member Clawson expressed concern with the new addition. The existing building lacks architectural character and the new addition is just being added on with no attempt to transition the two styles of architecture. The proposed addition is well designed, however, the connection between the two buildings needs to be addressed.

Since Board Member Gary Perkins could not be in attendance, he sent in comments. Board Chair Duenke noted for the record that he had no comments for this project but he did note that it was a good job in keeping with the existing quality and character of the development.

Board Chair Duenke asked why the pedestrian entrance was so diminutive in comparison to the mass of the building. Ms. Perry stated that due to security purposes, there are certain entrances that are primary entrances. This entrance is for independent units and not a public entrance.

Board Chair Duenke also concurred with Board Member Clawson that some type of transition is needed between the two architectural types and she does like the articulation on the proposed addition. Ms. Perry stated that the older sections will be updated in phases and some structures will be taken down or added to at some point in the future. In some cases, you would not want to simplify the new architecture just to match the older unarticulated buildings. Wendy Geckeler, Planning Commission Liaison asked if they could use evergreens as a buffer. Ms. Perry stated there is landscaping in that area already but there is also a fire exit at that location so it would not be feasible.

Board Member Rick Clawson made a motion to forward the 6th Partial Amended Site Development Plan, Amended Landscape Plan, Amended Lighting Plan, Architectural Elevations and architect's Statement of Design for Friendship Village of West County to the Planning Commission with the following recommendation:

- 1. Recommend adding architectural detailing, material change or some type of offset where the south and east corners of the proposed addition intersect with the existing brick building to give a solid differential statement of design between the two buildings.**

**Board Member Mary Brown seconded the motion.
Motion passed with a voice vote of 4-0.**

Planning Commissioner Mike Watson recommended that any proposed change be seen by the Architectural Review Board before it is presented to the Planning Commission. Ms. Aimee Nassif, Planning and Development Services Director said that whenever there is a significant change she will submit the changes to the Architectural Review Board Chair first for feedback.

- C. 13435 Olive Boulevard (Kim Cheese): Amended Architectural Elevations for a for a restaurant building on a 0.27 acre tract of land, zoned "PC" Planned Commercial District located on the north side of Olive Boulevard just east of its intersection with Woodsmill Road (16Q331031).**

Shawn Seymour, Senior Planner, presented the project for a color change to the EIFS of a fast food style restaurant located at the northeast corner of Olive and Woods Mill Road, the former Dairy Queen restaurant. The building was originally approved with stone and brick veneer with beige and black EIFS. The applicant has already painted the EIFS blue and yellow they are seeking approval for the color change at this time.

Discussion

Mr. Seymour confirmed that the red awning has not been changed; it was part of Dairy Queen's corporate image. He stated this is a different color for the area, however, Brunswick Zone has fairly similar colors with brick instead of stone, and the 7-Eleven is brick, orange, green, and red. Planning Commission Member Mike Watson asked if any nearby business have commented on the color. Mr. Seymour stated that only those passing by have commented on the color. This is individually owned and not a franchise.

Board Chair, Carol Duenke read aloud Board Member Perkins' comments on this item and agreed with them. He noted that he would recommend staying with what originally was approved and would not vote in support of this change. The blue and yellow in combination with the brick and stone is too stark of a contrast. Board Member Rick Clawson concurred with his comments and based on current Architectural Review Board standards, Brunswick Zone and the 7-Eleven would not be allowed now. It is not consistent with the quality of design and material that is currently in the standards.

Board Member Rick Clawson made a motion to forward to staff the Amended Architectural Elevations for 13455 Olive Boulevard (Kim Cheese), as presented, with a recommendation for denial along with a suggestion of using a color combination based on the originally approved earth tone colors.

**Board Member Matt Adams seconded the motion.
Motion passed with a voice vote of 4-0.**

- D. Chesterfield Commons, Out Lot 10 (Red Lobster):** Amended Architectural Elevations for a restaurant building on a 1.72 acre tract of land, zoned "C8" Planned Commercial District located south of Chesterfield Airport Road and west of JW Drive (17T130133).

Shawn Seymour, Senior Planner, presented the project request for amended elevations for the Red Lobster restaurant located on the south side of Chesterfield Airport Road just west of its intersection with JW Drive. The request is for approval of a color change to the Hardie plank siding and the unpainted wooden supports for the gabled entry of the existing building. The applicant also wishes to enclose the existing entry gables with wooden shingles. They are requesting to change the paint on the Hardie plank siding from blue to burgundy. The existing wood trim is not painted and they are proposing to paint it white. They will also replace some of the existing architectural rooftop lighting and remove the faux metal shutters on the sides of the building.

Discussion

Mike Watson, Planning Commission, stated that he Planning Commission would be interested in the type of lighting.

Board Member Rick Clawson made a motion to forward the amended Architectural Elevations for Chesterfield Commons, Outlot 10 (Red Lobster), as presented, to staff for approval with the recommendation that staff review the rooftop lighting with respect to the City's Lighting Ordinance.

**Motion seconded by Board Member Mary Brown.
Motion passed by a voice vote of 4-0.**

E. Windsor Crossing Community Church: 6th Amended Site Plan, Landscape Plan, Lighting Plan, Architectural Elevations and an Architect's Statement of Design for a church located on a 35.10 acre "NU" Non-Urban District – zoned property located at 114 N. Eatherton Road.

Shawn Seymour, Senior Planner, presented the project in Kristian Corbin's absence. The project request is for a 37,000 sq. ft. addition to the southern portions of the existing structure. Additionally, the applicant has proposed a 3,200 sq. ft. standalone maintenance structure on the north portion of the property. The site is located in the far west end of Chesterfield Valley. The main part of the addition is to be an auditorium which includes a children's area. Parking will also be expanded to accommodate the addition. The proposed materials for the addition will match the existing structure and the maintenance storage structure will be a pre-finished metal-sided building with a metal roof.

Discussion

Board Member Rick Clawson questioned how they will handle screening of the mechanical equipment, ground-mounted utilities, etc. Mr. Seymour stated nothing will be ground-mounted but anything roof mounted will be screened with a parapet.

Board Member Clawson stated that in the past, the Board has not allowed just a pre-finished metal building. The Board has allowed metal siding attached to buildings on the airport, but never by itself. Taking into consideration the location of the maintenance building, this should not be a problem but he didn't want to set a precedent. Mr. Seymour suggested additional landscaping to screen the building. Ms. Nassif stated the Board would not be making a precedent here because this is not the primary building on site.

Board Chair Carol Duenke read the following comments from Board Member Perkins:

1. Architecturally he is oaky with the request. The new addition continues the architectural theme of the existing building. He will defer to the architects regarding whether they want any additional articulation of the tilt-up walls.
2. Regarding the landscaping:
 - a. He encourages the petitioner to provide both flowering trees and evergreen trees in groups or clusters periodically along the outside of the perimeter of the parking lots to help break up the

currently uninterrupted views of the cars. The canopy trees in the parking lot are fine but there is currently nothing softening views of the parking lot from surrounding areas. Due to the large scale of the site, flowering and evergreen trees would be more effective than shrubs.

- b. He sees nothing addressing screening of the maintenance building. Although its location is remote within the site, it is not an attractive building. Again, a few flowering trees and evergreen trees as well as some canopy trees would be encouraged to break up views to this building from the church building.
- c. Additional questions regarding the maintenance building: Will any equipment or supplies be stored outside? It is not shown on the plan, but if this is a possibility, it should be screened.

Mr. Seymour stated that nothing would be stored outside the maintenance building.

Board Member Mary Brown suggested planting ornamental grasses as a buffer because do get very large.

Board Chair Duenke stated there are some very large unbroken expanses of uninterrupted material which is not in keeping with the current standards, however, it is in keeping with the existing architectural. In the past, we have asked petitioners to break up very large expanses of uninterrupted walls. Board Member Clawson felt that with the shape of the wall, it is part of the architecture and matches the existing and it would not be appropriate to break it up in this instance. The massing of the proposed addition is very interesting and does provide articulation in and of itself. The maintenance building needs a lot of screening though. The petitioner is considering adding a berm around the building with large grasses. The elevations do not depict this, but their preference is to use creative screening that does not draw attention to the building.

Board Member Matt Adams made a motion to forward to the Planning Commission the 6th Amended Site Development Plan, Landscape Plan, Lighting Plan and Architectural Elevations for Windsor Crossing Community Church with the recommendation to provide buffering to the maintenance building with the addition of a berm with fountain grasses or other vegetation that would be indigenous to prairie style landscaping.

**Motion was seconded by Board Member Mary Brown.
Motion passed with a voice vote of 4-0.**

III. APPROVAL OF MEETING SUMMARY

A. May 10, 2012

Board Member Rick Clawson made a motion to approve the meeting summary as written.

Board Member Mary Brown seconded the motion.

Motion passed with a voice vote of 3-0 with Board Member Adams abstaining.

IV. OLD BUSINESS

None.

V. NEW BUSINESS

None.

VI: ADJOURNMENT

Board Member Matt Adams made a motion to adjourn the meeting.

Board Member Rick Clawson seconded the motion.

Motion passed by voice vote of 4-0 and the meeting adjourned at 7:45 p.m.